



Critical Review of Income Accounting on Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines

Yohan Bakhtiar^a, Dion Yanuarmawan^a, Atik Tri Andari^a, Binti Shofiatul Jannah^b

^aPSDKU Politeknik Negeri Malang, Kediri, Indonesia

^bUniversitas Islam Negeri Sunan Ampel Surabaya, Surabaya, Indonesia

Article History

Received

3 May 2023

Received in revised form

26 May 2023

Accepted

27 May 2023

Published Online

31 May 2023

*Corresponding author

yohan_bakhtiar@yahoo.co.id

Abstract

This study aims to criticize the income account contained in *Pesantren* Accounting Guidelines (*Pedoman Akuntansi Pesantren / PAP*). The critical paradigm is used as an "umbrella" for research with critical analysis as a research method. The results of this study indicate that (1) The definition of income in PAP and income in business entities is "almost" the same. This can be proven by the words "increase in economic benefits in assets and equity". (2) Making the contribution of *santri* as one of the unrestricted incomes is an inappropriate policy because *santri* are not a commodity for making money. *Santri* are the next generation who have good morals, both in the world and the hereafter.

Keywords: Accounting, Criticism, Guidelines, Income, Islamic Boarding School

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.35145/jabt.v4i2.124>

1.0 INTRODUCTION

Since the publication of the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Manual (*Pedoman Akuntansi Pesantren / PAP*) for the first time in Surabaya, November 7-11 2017 to be precise, coinciding with the activities of the Indonesia *Shari'a* Economic Festival (ISEF), many sharia accounting activists have welcomed the presence of this guideline. reference in financial reporting in Islamic boarding schools.

Over time after the publication of the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines, many researchers tend to focus on seeing whether these guidelines have been implemented by several Islamic boarding schools or not. An example of research (Solikhah, Sudiby, and Susilowati 2019) which states that most Islamic boarding schools in the Banyumas district have not implemented PSAK 45 and Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines in preparing their financial reports. This is in line with research (Suherman 2019) which states that the *Al-Matuf* Islamic boarding school, Sukabumi has not implemented Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines in its financial recording and reporting.

Several other studies have tried to implement these Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines, such as research conducted (Sulistiani 2020) which aims to find out the process of preparing financial reports in terms of recognition, measurement, recording, disclosure, and presentation at the Sabilurrosyad Islamic Boarding School. This is the same as research (Rozaidin and Adinugraha 2020) which aims to examine how accounting is applied and its compatibility with accounting standards in the *Al Hasyimi* Islamic boarding school cooperative and to find out the importance of accounting for an institution.

Indeed, there is nothing unusual about some of these studies, almost all of them think positively that if there are guidelines launched by the IAI (Indonesian Institute of Accountants) then they must be immediately implemented according to the context of these guidelines. However, isn't there anything that needs to be contemplated and questioned again with the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines?

Research (Jannah et al. 2022) seems to be a thought-provoker from another point of view regarding the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines where the research aims to (1) conduct a study of the "power" of assets in the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines through a critical perspective, and (2) formulate re-definition of *pesantren* assets by referring back to the Qur'an and the Yellow Book. Furthermore (Jannah et al. 2022) also states that a "critical" review of assets proves that the current definition of assets in the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines is a derivative of modern accounting. This finding can be interpreted that other

accounts in the PAP should also be examined more deeply to prove whether the account is a derivative concept from conventional accounting or not.

When it comes to accounting knowledge, there will be many accounts that need to be discussed, such as assets, liabilities, capital, expenses, income, and so on. In order to focus on examining more deeply, this study aims to criticize the income accounts contained in the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines (Income and Expense Accounting).

2.0 LITERATURE REVIEW

Pondok Pesantren is an Islamic educational institution with a dormitory or *Pondok* system, where *kyai* is the central figure, the mosque is the center for religious activities, and the teaching of Islam under the guidance of the *kyai* is followed by the *santri* as its main activity. Islamic boarding schools can also be referred to as places where students learn to live and socialize in various aspects of social life.

(Joint Decree of the Minister of Religion and Minister of Home Affairs 1979) classifies Islamic boarding schools into Type A Islamic Boarding Schools, namely Islamic boarding schools with students studying and living in boarding schools with traditional teaching (*wetonan* or *sorogan* system). Type B Islamic Boarding Schools, namely Islamic boarding schools that carry out classical teaching and teaching by *kyai* that are applied in nature, are given at certain times. *Santri* lives in a boarding school environment dormitory. Type C Islamic Boarding Schools, namely Islamic boarding schools are only dormitories while the students study outside (in *madrasah* or other public schools), the *kyai* only supervises and guides these students. Type D Islamic Boarding Schools, namely Islamic boarding schools organize a boarding school system and at the same time a school or *madrasah* system.

Some critical research in Islamic accounting has been carried out by Mulawarman and Kamayanti (2018) which aims to shed light on how accounting, which has been recognized as a contributor to the modernity problem, has been influenced by secular anthropology, which hinges on the concept of "self". The findings of this study explain that accounting has been greatly affected by secular Western culture through education and educators as agents that find their legitimation in country policies. Standard setters have also taken the same stance by siding with the capital market. If these findings are related to the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines (PAP), there is a connection that could be the purpose of this PAP being made to accommodate market interests which are not specific to the Islamic boarding school itself. This can be seen from the history of PAP's preparation based on SAK ETAP and PSAK 45, not to be made pure for Islamic boarding schools.

3.0 METHODOLOGY

This study uses a critical paradigm as a research "umbrella". The critical analysis method is applied to examine more deeply the substance of the income account listed in the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Manual (*Pedoman Akuntansi Pesantren / PAP*). Besides that, researchers will also analyze the comparison of income accounts in Islamic boarding schools that have been described in the LAP with income accounts in conventional businesses. A qualitative approach is used in this study in order to sharpen the analytical "knife" in criticizing income accounts.

Similar research methods but of course different have been carried out by Bakhtiar et al. (2019). In this study, the method used was critical descriptive analysis to connect the "common threads" from various perspectives on the meaning of profit so that substantive findings were obtained.

There are several qualitative studies that use a critical approach in viewing social reality. One of the critical studies in accounting science conducted by Sitorus et al. (2017). This study offers *homo pancasila* as antithesis to *homo economicus*. *Homo economicus* has become the ontology of Positive Accounting Theory (PAT) that dominates capitalistic accounting. With this critical research, it indicates that the science of accounting should be understood from several different perspectives (multiparadigm), not only from one point of view, namely positivism.

4.0 RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Many research with a critical paradigm in accounting science has developed rapidly along with the modernity of the era clad in capitalism. Why is critical thinking important? "The aim of critique is to make things better even though it might make us uncomfortable" (Gaffikin 2010).

Accounting is loaded with value and not value free. Likewise with sharia accounting, when viewed from a pragmatism point of view, of course it is almost no different from conventional accounting, only added with sharia "frills". Luckily there is still a group of research accountants who have an idealistic point of view, so that what is the reality of sharia accounting in real life is always linked and returned in accordance with the teachings of As - Sunnah and Al Qur'an.

Every guideline issued by any institution must have certain advantages and disadvantages. Including the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines, where the existing advantages are expected to be properly applied

by interested parties in carrying out sharia accounting. However, if there are a number of things that are lacking, of course it's only natural to give constructive criticism. There are no perfect guidelines if made by a group of humans.

The income account described in the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines is contained in chapter VII Accounting for Income and Expenses. The definition of income according to Islamic Boarding School Accounting Manual (*Pedoman Akuntansi Pesantren / PAP*) is an increase in economic benefits during the accounting period in the form of income or additions to assets or decreases in liabilities resulting in an increase in net assets. When viewed from the notion of revenue (revenues) from the point of view of business entities is an increase in assets and owner's equity as a result of selling goods or services to customers (Warren et al. 2021). If examined more deeply, these two meanings are actually "almost the same" in substance, even though Islamic boarding school foundations are not pure business entities even though there are indeed several business units under the auspices of Islamic boarding school foundations, but even then, only in large Islamic boarding schools.

However, there are also many *salafiyah* Islamic boarding schools in Indonesia that do not have a specific business unit because they are focused on being a place to gain religious knowledge, so the concept of income in the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines is certainly not appropriate if applied in general terms to all existing Islamic boarding schools. In Indonesia. Further analysis, namely income is divided into restricted and unrestricted income. The classification is based on whether there are restrictions from resource providers, sharia provisions, and laws and regulations on funds received by Islamic boarding school foundations. Restricted income consists of: (a) Waqf receipts, in the form of waqf money, waqf movable assets other than money, and waqf immovable assets, as well as the net proceeds from the management and development of waqf assets. (b) Assistance from the government, corporations and the public whose usage is restricted; (c) Other restricted income. Unrestricted income, among others, consists of: (a) Contributions from students; (b) Grants from the founders and administrators of Islamic boarding school foundations; (c) Assistance from the government, corporations and the public that has no restrictions on its use; (d) Restricted net assets that have expired; (e) Other unrestricted income.

The various types of restricted and unrestricted income, there are several things that need to be underlined, one of which is the contribution of the *santri*. Indeed, there are several Islamic boarding schools that have monthly payment rules for their students. This money is usually used for the operational activities of each *santri*, such as boarding/lodging, food and drink a month, and other needs. But it should also be noted, there are Islamic boarding schools that free fees for their students. Criticism of the use of income accounts for student contributions which according to the author needs to be underlined. Why? Because if the contribution of the *santri* is considered as income, then what is the difference from the *Lembaga Bimbingan Belajar* (Tutoring Institute / LBB) where every student who enters the LBB must pay a certain amount of money monthly in order to be able to take part in learning activities in class.

This is, of course, a very significant difference, where the main goal of the *kyai* or Islamic boarding school caretakers in establishing Islamic boarding schools is as a forum for students to gain religious knowledge, learn simplicity and independence so that later it is hoped that students and female students can be safe in the world and the hereafter (*fiddunyaa wal akhirat*). And researchers are sure that in the minds of the *kyai* there is not even the slightest thought to make *santri* a producer of financial coffers for Islamic boarding schools.

It is undeniable that financial reporting in profit or non-profit entities is indeed important to implement, in order to create transparency and accountability of these entities to interested parties. However, in Islamic boarding schools, there should be special "treatment" where people with noble character are created, not just a place to pursue mere material gain under the guise of financial reports.

All of this critical analysis makes sense because indeed the Indonesian Association of Accountants (*Ikatan Akuntan Indonesia / IAI*) in initiating the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines refers to the Financial Accounting Standards for Entities Without Public Accountability (*Standar Akuntansi Keuangan Entitas Tanpa Akuntabilitas Publik / SAK ETAP*). "The main reference for preparing financial reports for Islamic boarding schools is the SAK ETAP issued by IAI's Financial Accounting Standards Board" (Bank Indonesia & Indonesian Institute of Accountants 2018). Supposedly, if we really want to help the accountability of Islamic boarding school foundations in their financial reporting, then stakeholders must be able to see with their own eyes that Islamic boarding schools have a different "*honor*" if compared with other non-profit entities.

The accounts in the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Guidelines should also be adjusted to the needs of Islamic boarding schools, instead of referring to SAK ETAP and PSAK 45 concerning financial reporting of non-profit entities. There needs to be a redefinition of several accounts in the PAP so that they are more in line with the context of the needs of Islamic boarding schools.

5.0 CONCLUSION

Every existing policy should be the subject of joint study and discussion in order to achieve good in this world and the hereafter. Some of the following things can be a record of the critical analysis of income accounts contained in the Islamic Boarding School Accounting Manual (*Pedoman Akuntansi Pesantren / PAP*).

1. The substance of the understanding of income accounts in PAP and the meaning of income in business entities can be said to be "almost" the same. This can be proven by the words "increase in economic benefits in assets and equity".
2. Making the contribution of santri as one of the unrestricted income is an inappropriate policy because santri are not a commodity for making money. *Santri* are the next generation who have good morals, both in the world and the hereafter.

Stakeholders should restore the "honor" of Islamic boarding schools as institutions that educate *santri* and *santriwati* who understand and practice religious knowledge and also equip them with certain skills as provisions to live life in society. Not the other way around by equating it with other entities in its financial reporting. This of course will degrade the noble ideals of the founders of Islamic boarding schools to spread religious knowledge and *akhlakul karimah* to all of their students.

References

- Bank Indonesia & Ikatan Akuntan Indonesia. 2018. *Pedoman Akuntansi Pesantren*. Jakarta: Departemen Ekonomi dan Keuangan Syariah.
- Gaffikin, Michael. 2010. "Being Critical in Accounting." *International Review of Business Research Papers*, 6(5): 33–45.
- Jannah, Binti Shofiatul, M. Luthfillah Habibi, Mochammad Ilyas Junjuran, and Ratna Anggraini Aripriatiwi. 2022. "Jihat Ammah: Redefinition of Assets in Islamic Boarding Schools Accounting Framework." *WIGA: Jurnal Penelitian Ilmu Ekonomi*, 12(2): 131–138.
- Keputusan Bersama Menteri Agama dan Menteri Dalam Negeri. 1979. *Tatacara Pelaksanaan Penyiaran Agama Dan Bantuan Luar Negeri Kepada Lembaga Keagamaan Di Indonesia*. Indonesia.
- Mulawarman, Aji Dedi, and Ari Kamayanti. 2018. "Towards Islamic Accounting Anthropology: How secular anthropology reshaped accounting in Indonesia". *Journal of Islamic Accounting and Business Research*, 9(4): 629-647. DOI [10.1108/JIABR-02-2015-0004](https://doi.org/10.1108/JIABR-02-2015-0004)
- Rozaidin, Muhamad, and Hendri Hermawan Adinugraha. 2020. "Penerapan Akuntansi Pondok Pesantren (Studi Pada Koperasi Pondok Pesantren Al Hasyimi Kabupaten Pekalongan)." *EKONOMIKA SYARIAH: Journal of Economic Studies*, 4(2): 136–47. <https://doi.org/10.30983/es.v4i2.3716>.
- Sitorus, Jordan Hotman Ekklesia., Iwan Triyuwono, and Ari Kamayanti. 2017. "Homo Economicus vis a vis Homo Pancasila: A Fight against Positive Accounting Theory". *Pertanika Journal: Social Sciences & Humanities*, 25(S): 311-320.
- Solikhah, Yudha Aryo Sudiby, and Dewi Susilowati. 2019. "Fenomena Kualitas Laporan Keuangan Pesantren Berdasar Pedoman Akuntansi Pesantren Dan PSAK NO 45." *SAR (Soedirman Accounting Review): Journal of Accounting and Business*, 3(1): 19–39.
- Suherman, Lukas Pamungkas. 2019. "Analisis Pentingnya Akuntansi Pesantren Bagi Pondok Pesantren Al-Matuq Sukabumi." *Jati: Jurnal Akuntansi Terapan Indonesia*, 2(2): 65–70. <https://doi.org/10.18196/jati.020220>.
- Sulistiani, Dwi. 2020. "Akuntansi Pesantren Sesuai SAK ETAP Dan PSAK 45 Dalam Penyusunan Laporan Keuangan Pesantren." *AKTSAR: Jurnal Akuntansi Syariah*, 3(1): 31–48. <https://doi.org/10.21043/aktsar.v3i1.7198>.
- Warren, Carl S., James M. Reeve, Jonathan Duchac, Ersya Tri Wahyuni, and Amir Abadi Jusuf. 2021. *Pengantar Akuntansi 1 (Adaptasi Indonesia Edisi 4)*. 4th ed. Salemba Empat.